

9 September 2010

REFERRAL RESPONSE - HERITAGE

FILE NO: DA 257/2010/1

ADDRESS: 88 Newcastle Street ROSE BAY 2029

PROPOSAL: The demolition of 88 Newcastle Street (dwelling), 94 Newcastle Street (dwelling), 96-98 Newcastle Street (St Paul's Anglican Church and former Parish Hall) and the construction of a mixed use development comprising of a new residential flat building, new childcare centre, and the retention of the existing Greek Orthodox Church of the Parish of St George.

FROM: Sara Reilly - Strategic Heritage Officer

TO: Ms E Smith

Application documents

The following documentation provided by the applicant has been examined for this referral response:

- Drawing set by Beraldo Design, numbered DA01-DA13, dated March 2010
- Heritage Impact Statement by Rappoport Pty Ltd, dated April 2009
- Addendum to Draft Demolition Report by Rod Howard and Associates Pty Ltd, dated May 2010
- Statement of Environmental Effects by Lockrey Planning and Development Solutions Pty Ltd, dated May 2010
- Interpretation Strategy by Rod Howard and Associates Pty Ltd, dated May 2010
- Heritage Assessment by NBRS and Partners, dated July 2010

Research

The following research was undertaken in the preparation of this assessment:

- The site was previously inspected on the 19 March and 23 June 2010. The interior was inspected.

Review of documents and photographic evidence:

- Review of Council's property system to establish dates of earlier building and development applications.
- Review of Council's photography files relevant to immediate area
- Review of Council's inventory sheets
- Review of Council's aerial photography and mapping database
- Review Google Maps – street view

Statutory and policy documents

The following statutory and policy documents are relevant to the application:

- Woollahra LEP 1995

- Woollahra Residential DCP 2003

Heritage status

- The subject buildings are not heritage items.
- The subject buildings are in the vicinity of the heritage item, the Royal Sydney Golf Club.
- The subject buildings are within the Rose Bay precinct.
- The subject buildings are not listed on the State Heritage Register.
- The subject buildings are not a potential heritage item in terms of the Draft LEP Amendment 66 – Heritage Items.
- The buildings have recently been nominated for listing as local heritage items. This nomination was overturned by the NSW Department of Planning in a gateway determination on the 25 August 2010, the reasons being that there was not sufficient justification given the conflicting heritage advice, and that the proposed listing was not consistent with Council's strategic planning framework, which had on no previous occasion decided to list the items.

Significance of any heritage item in the vicinity

The Royal Sydney Golf Club is located on the eastern side of Kent Road and has frontage to New South Head Road. The grounds surrounding the clubhouse contain a number of shrubs and mature trees in terraced and rolling lawns and are significant for their contribution to the leafy character of the surrounding area. The Golf Club has social and historical significance for its association with many prominent Sydney identities.

The Royal Sydney Golf Club will not be affected by the proposed development.

Assessment of heritage impact

Relevant statutory and policy documents

The assessment is made using the following statutory and policy heritage conservation provisions:

Woollahra LEP 1995 Part 1 clause 2(1)(g) and 2(2)(g); Part 4 clause 27 and 28
Woollahra Residential DCP 2003 (WRDCP 2003)

- The development application is for demolition of the four existing buildings (two Federation dwellings and two former Anglican Church buildings) and redevelopment of the site for aged housing and child care facilities.
- This report is subsequent to a previous report to the Urban Planning Committee in June from the same author. The previous report was in regard to a Council resolution to investigate the heritage significance of the four buildings on the subject site. The report concluded that there were not sufficient grounds to list either the two Federation dwellings or the two church buildings as heritage items on Woollahra LEP.

- Subsequent to this, the Council commissioned a further and independent heritage assessment of the five buildings on the site from Brian McDonald of HBO + EMTB. This report indicated that the two former church buildings did meet the criteria for listing, and should be listed as a group item.
- The Council then nominated the two former church buildings for listing in a planning proposal submission to the NSW Department of Planning. The Department decided not to proceed with the listing.
- The applicant then submitted a further heritage assessment by NBRS and Partners in support of their development application. This report indicated that the buildings do not reach sufficient criteria for listing.
- This report concludes (in a similar manner to the previous Urban Planning Committee report) that the four subject buildings do not meet the criteria for listing on Woollahra LEP.
- In regard to the current development application, there will undoubtedly be loss of heritage significance on the site due to the demolition of the four buildings. All buildings are intact, good representative examples of their type.
- Adaptive re-use of all four buildings is desirable from a heritage point of view however it is clear that this may not meet the needs of the owner. Adaptation would allow some preservation and retention of the existing local streetscapes and built forms which contribute to the character of the area.
- It is clear that the existing buildings do not have heritage protection from possible demolition, as they are not heritage-listed items nor in a conservation area.
- The proposed new buildings are of a generic design that has no reference to the local area or the local and immediate character of the neighbouring buildings.

Conclusion

The application is generally not acceptable as it does not comply with all the provisions of the relevant statutory and policy documents as shown in the above assessment and would have an unsatisfactory heritage impact.

Recommendation

- The applicant explore options for retention or partial retention of the existing buildings (by retaining and building upon their forms, materials, and styles) through adaptive re-use and additions.

OR

- The applicant provide an alternative design based on high quality referential and sympathetic architecture that responds to the existing buildings on site.

- The sandstone boundary wall should be retained in any new development. These elements are an important historic element which contributes to the streetscape and sense of address.
- If Council grants consent to the demolition of the four buildings then the buildings should be recorded. Standard condition B3 *Recording of significant or contributory buildings prior to any demolition* should be used.
- If Council grants consent to the demolition of the four buildings then a thorough and detailed Interpretation Strategy should be implemented for the site to allow the social and historic values of the site to be perpetuated.
 - a) The two main items of importance are the two foundation stones for the former church buildings. These are by no means the only significant interpretive items for the site.
 - b) Opportunities should be explored to conserve the fabric of the existing church buildings on site through re-using the stained glass windows, timber beams and other decorative joinery, windows, doors etc. in new work.
 - c) The local community should be given the opportunity to be involved and consulted regarding the retention of meaning and association on the site.
 - d) The Interpretation Strategy should use the Heritage Branch's *Heritage Information Series: Interpreting Heritage Places and Items, Guidelines* as a basis for any interpretation strategy for the site.

Sara Reilly
Strategic Heritage Officer

4 August 2010

REFERRAL RESPONSE - HERITAGE

FILE NO: DA 257/2010/1

ADDRESS: 88 Newcastle Street ROSE BAY 2029

PROPOSAL: The demolition of 88 Newcastle Street (dwelling), 94 Newcastle Street (dwelling), 96-98 Newcastle Street (St Paul's Anglican Church and former Parish Hall) and the construction of a mixed use development comprising of a new residential flat building, new childcare centre, and the retention of the existing Greek Orthodox Church of the Parish of St George.

FROM: Sara Reilly - Heritage Officer

TO: Ms E Smith

Introduction

A pre-DA meeting for the proposal was held in September 2009, in which Council's Heritage Officer showed support for the demolition of the four buildings subject to certain conditions being met. The subject development application was lodged on the 2 June 2010. However, prior to this, the Urban Planning Committee had requested an urgent heritage assessment of the four buildings proposed to be demolished. Council then provided an assessment (by the same author of this referral) that found that the buildings did not meet the criteria for listing. The UPC then requested an independent heritage assessment, which was carried out by Brian McDonald of HBO + ETMB. This report found that the two church buildings were worthy of listing as heritage items.

Thus the development application is currently unable to be adequately assessed, as the status of the heritage buildings is unresolved. The following is an outline of the information, research and other matters affecting development on the site.

Application documents

The following documentation provided by the applicant has been examined for this referral response:

- Drawing set by Beraldo Design, numbered DA01-DA13, dated March 2010
- Heritage Impact Statement/ report by Rappoport Pty Ltd, dated April 2009
- Addendum to Draft Demolition Report by Rod Howard and Associates Pty Ltd, dated May 2010
- Statement of Environmental Effects by Lockrey Planning and Development Solutions Pty Ltd, dated May 2010
- Interpretation Strategy by Rod Howard and Associates Pty Ltd, dated May 2010

Research

The following research was undertaken in the preparation of this assessment:

- The site was inspected on the 19 March and 23 June 2010. The interior was inspected.

Review of documents and photographic evidence:

- Review of Council's property system to establish dates of earlier building and development applications.
- Review of Council's photography files relevant to immediate area
- Review of Council's inventory sheets
- Review of Council's aerial photography and mapping database
- Review Google Maps – street view
- Review NearMaps

Statutory and policy documents

The following statutory and policy documents are relevant to the application:

- Woollahra LEP 1995
- Woollahra Residential DCP 2003

Heritage status

- The subject buildings are not heritage items.
- The subject buildings are in the vicinity of the heritage item, the Royal Sydney Golf Club.
- The subject buildings are within the Rose Bay precinct.
- The subject buildings are not listed on the State Heritage Register.
- The subject buildings are not a potential heritage item in terms of the Draft LEP Amendment 66 – Heritage Items, but have recently been the subject of an independent review commissioned by Council, the result of which being that the two church buildings have been earmarked for listing as a group heritage item. This process is currently underway.

Significance of any heritage item in the vicinity

The Royal Sydney Golf Club is located on the eastern side of Kent Road and has frontage to New South Head Road. The grounds surrounding the clubhouse contain a number of shrubs and mature trees in terraced and rolling lawns and are significant for their contribution to the leafy character of the surrounding area. The Golf Club has social and historical significance for its association with many prominent Sydney identities.

The Royal Sydney Golf Club will not be affected by the proposed development.

Assessment of heritage impact

Relevant statutory and policy documents

This assessment is a brief overview of the main considerations of the impact of the development, and is in no way conclusive or exhaustive:

Woollahra LEP 1995 Clause 2(1)g

'To conserve the environmental heritage of the area of Woollahra'

- The proposal will cause some loss of significance due to the demolition of four existing buildings in Newcastle Street. The significance will be lost in two ways:
 1. The loss of four contributory items within the streetscape of Newcastle St and Old South Head Road.
 2. The loss of association of three of these buildings with the former Rose Bay parish of the St Paul's Anglican Church.

Woollahra Residential Development Control Plan 2003 (WRDCP)

'Recent development... has seen the subdivision pattern altered to create large allotments for residential flat buildings, and which has seen a change in local character. A change of character is also encouraged along Old South Head Road with a view to providing a greater density of development adjacent to the regional road, and a transition to smaller development behind, where a mix of residential houses and smaller residential flat buildings is envisaged'.

- The proposed ongoing use of the site as a Christian Church-related development is in keeping with the aims of the WRDCP, and further, is the type of development encouraged by the WRDCP.

Conclusion

It is not possible to complete an adequate heritage response for the current development application at this time, as the two church buildings are proposed by Council to be listed as a group heritage item, and their status is currently unresolved.

Assessment of the development application is impossible until the status is resolved.

Recommendation

That the heritage review of the development application be suspended while the process of listing the two church buildings is resolved.

That any future and subsequent changes to the development application be reviewed when the outcome of the listing proposal is finalised.

Sara Reilly
Heritage Officer